1	Final - Minutes
2	Forensic Science Board Meeting
3	January 6, 2016
4	Department of Forensic Science, Central Laboratory, Classroom 1
5	Doord Mombors Dresont
6	Board Members Present Vince Dene shue, Essen Commensues 44/3, Atterney (Designed of Senator Themes V
7	Vince Donoghue, Essex Commonwealth's Attorney (Designee of Senator Thomas K.
8 9	Norment, Jr., Senator Mark D. Obenshain, Co-Chairs, Senate Courts of Justice
9 10	Committee) - Forensic Science Board Chair Francine C. Ecker, Director, Department of Criminal Justice Services
10	James F. Entas, Esq., Assistant Attorney General (Designee of Attorney General
12	Mark R. Herring)
12	William T. Gormley, M.D., Chief Medical Examiner
14	Karl R. Hade, Executive Secretary, Supreme Court of Virginia
15	Sammy Johnson, Deputy Executive Director, Board of Pharmacy (Designee of Caroline
16	Juran, Executive Director, Board of Pharmacy)
17	David A. C. Long, Esq.
18	Lieutenant Colonel Robert B. Northern, Deputy Superintendent, Virginia State Police, (Designee
19	of Colonel W. Steven Flaherty, Superintendent, Virginia State Police)
20	Claiborne H. Stokes, Jr., Commonwealth's Attorney, Goochland County
21	
22	
23	Board Members Absent
24	Jo Ann Given, Member, Scientific Advisory Committee
25	Kristen J. Howard, Executive Director of the Virginia State Crime Commission (Designee
26	of Senator Thomas K. Norment, Jr., Chair, Virginia State Crime Commission) - G. Stewart
27	Petoe, Director of Legal Affairs of the Virginia State Crime Commission, attended the
28	meeting on Ms. Howard's behalf
29	Anthony A. Lippa, Jr., Sheriff, Caroline County
30	Alphonse Poklis, Ph.D., Member, Scientific Advisory Committee
31	Richard L. Morris, Delegate (Designee of Delegate David B. Albo, Chair, House Courts
32	of Justice Committee)
33	
34	Legal Counsel for the Forensic Science Board
35	Michelle Welch, Esq., Assistant Attorney General
36	Staff Moushour Duccout
37 38	Staff Members Present D. Jeffery Ban, Central Laboratory Director
38 39	Sabrina S. Cillessen, Physical Evidence Program Manager
40	Amy M. Curtis, Department Counsel
40	Katya N. Herndon, Chief Deputy Director
42	Linda C. Jackson, Department Director
43	Bradford C. Jenkins, Forensic Biology Program Manager
44	Alka B. Lohmann, Director of Technical Services

- M. Scott Maye, Chemistry Program Manager Carisa Studer, Legal Assistant
- 46

47

48 Call to Order

49 Vince Donoghue, Chair of the Forensic Science Board ("Board"), called the meeting of the

50 Board to order at 9:08 a.m. The Chair welcomed the Board members and the Department of 51 Forensic Science ("Department" or "DFS") staff. The Chair also welcomed Stewart Petoe,

- 51 Forensic Science (Department of DFS) stari. The Chair also welcomed Stewart Petoe, 52 Director of Legal Affairs of the Virginia State Crime Commission, who attended the meeting on
- 53 the Kristen Howard's behalf.
- 54

55 Adoption of Agenda

The Chair asked if there were any additions or changes to the draft agenda for the meeting.
Being none, Dr. Gormley made a motion to adopt the agenda, which was seconded by Lt. Col.
Northern and adopted by unanimous vote of the Board.

59

60 Approval of Draft Minutes of the October 15, 2015 Meeting

The Chair asked if there were any changes or corrections to the draft minutes from the October 15, 2015 meeting. Being none, Mr. Long made a motion to adopt the minutes, which was seconded by Lt. Col. Northern and approved by unanimous vote of the Board.

64

65 <u>Chair's Report</u>

- 66 There was no formal report from the Chair.
- 67

68 **DFS Director's Report**

69 Director Jackson updated the Board on major projects for the upcoming year for the Department.

- 70
- 71 <u>Facilities:</u>

72 Director Jackson informed the Board of the status of the Western Laboratory expansion and 73 renovation project. The new building is almost complete. The final inspection is also today,

January 6, 2016. The certificate of occupancy is expected to be complete by January 25, 2016.

74 January 0, 2010. The certificate of occupancy is expected to be complete by January 25, 2010. 75 Once the new building is complete, DFS will move into the new space and then the renovations

76 will begin on the existing laboratory February 1, 2016. DFS anticipates the entire project to be

- 77 complete in the fall of 2016.
- 78

Director Jackson had reported to the Board at the October 15, 2015 meeting that negotiations were underway for the contract with an architectural and engineering firm for the Central Laboratory expansion project. Since the October meeting, negotiations have been terminated with the selected firm. The Department of General Services recommended that the Department do a re-solicitation for proposals. A new solicitation for proposals will be released within 30 days.

85

86 <u>DNA Data Bank:</u>

87 Director Jackson provided updated information on the number of misdemeanor samples

- submitted to the DNA Data Bank as a result of the law that went into effect July 1, 2015 that
- 89 requires adults convicted of nine additional misdemeanor offenses to provide samples for the
- 90 DNA Data Bank. The Department has continued to see an increase in submissions to the DNA
- 91 Databank since the additional misdemeanors offenses were added to the statute. Although the
- 92 rate of submissions has seemed to level off.

93 <u>Customer Satisfaction Survey:</u>

94 Director Jackson informed the Board that the Department distributed a customer satisfaction 95 survey to its user agencies on November 1, 2015 using SurveyMonkey[®]. The survey was open 96 from November 1 - 24. It was distributed to law enforcement agencies and Commonwealth's 97 The survey included questions about the overall utilization of services and Attorneys. 98 satisfaction, National Integrated Ballistic Information Network (NIBIN) search needs, and 99 Toxicology and Controlled Substances report needs. A total of 391 responses were received. 100 Currently, laboratory directors and section supervisors are analyzing the responses and reaching 101 out to commenters as needed. Director Jackson anticipates providing the results from the survey

- 102 at the next Board meeting.
- 103
- 104 Archived Case Files Project:

Director Jackson updated the Board on the archived case file project. DFS hired two wage employees to scan the archived case files (1973-1995) not in the laboratory information management system (LIMS). There is funding for two additional wage employees. Portions of the files are being scanned into a database that will be searchable, and the information from the database will be able to be uploaded into the upgraded LIMS. Approximately 1,900 records have been uploaded to data. There are approximately one million case files to be searchable

- 110 have been uploaded to date. There are approximately one million case files to be scanned.
- 111
- 112 <u>Retesting of Post-Conviction DNA Cases:</u>
- 113 Director Jackson updated the Board on the retesting of post-conviction DNA cases with 114 "inconclusive" results. The 33 "inclusive" cases recommended for testing have been sent to
- 115 Bode Cellmark Forensics, the private laboratory that awarded the contract to conduct the testing.
- 116 DFS staff conducted an onsite assessment of Bode on December 15, 2015 to review the facilities,
- 117 testing procedure, and personnel assigned to the testing.
- 118
- 119 <u>Budget Resources:</u>

Director Jackson provided an overview of the Department's Budget, including the proposed FY17 and FY18 changes. Director Jackson directed the Board to where additional information about the budget reductions is available online. The budget includes an increase of authorized positions from 310 to 318, savings budgeted from the 2015 general fund, and technical adjustments for changes to salaries/benefits and IT costs. Director Jackson noted that there was one item introduced for the FY16 budget bill to increase funding for the Western Laboratory's utilities cost and the need for an additional facilities maintenance position.

127

128 The budget includes funding for maintenance and support costs for the Laboratory Information 129 Management System (LIMS). An upgrade on the Department's current LIMS is in progress and 130 the new system will require an additional maintenance fee.

131

132 The budget also provides for additional funding for Physical Evidence Recovery Kits (PERK) 133 testing. The increase is based on the recommendations from the PERK Work Group's legislation

- that is expected to increase the volume of PERKs submitted to DFS. DFS will outsource PERKs
- in FY17 will plans for DFS staff to complete testing of all the additional PERKs by FY18.
- 136

137 Additional funding is provided for additional resources to trace firearms in the FY17 and FY18

budget. DFS is anticipating and additional 4,000 firearms submissions per year. Additional

- equipment and staffing will be needed.
- 140
- 141 <u>Grants</u>:

142 Director Jackson briefly reminded the Board on the Department's current grants which include:

- 143 the NIJ Research and Development of Publicly Funded Forensic Science Laboratories to Assess
- 144 the Testing and Processing of Physical Evidence; the 2016 Highway Safety Grant; the FY14 and
- 145 FY15 Paul Coverdell grants; the FY14 and FY15 DNA Capacity Enhancement and Backlog
- 146 Reduction Program grants; the Office of the Attorney General *Abbott* Settlement Forfeiture
- 147 Funds One-time Transfer; and the New York County District Attorney's Office Sexual Assault 148 Kit Backlag Elimination Program
- 148 Kit Backlog Elimination Program.
- 149
- 150 <u>Workload/Backlog:</u>

Director Jackson presented the Department's statistics in quarterly format using graphs reflecting cases received, cases completed, the caseload, and the average number of days in the system for each Section. The Firearms Section continues to see an increase in submissions due to the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives (ATF) encouraging law enforcement agencies to submit all guns for entry into the NIBIN system. The Department is working on a

- 156 strategy to streamline current procedures.
- 157

Director Jackson reminded the Board that there has been an increase in the turnaround time for the Forensic Biology Section over the past year due to the new requirements nationally for increased forensic biology statistics. Currently, there are seven new Forensic Biology examiners in training.

162

163 Director Jackson explained that currently the Digital Multi-Media Evidence (DMME) section is 164 included within the Latent Prints statistics. When the new LIMS is implemented the DMME 165 statistics will be separate.

166

167 Director Jackson noted that the Questioned Documents Sections is made up of three examiners 168 and one will be retiring in the near future. DFS plans on hiring a new examiner and having the 169 examiner fully qualified before the current examiner retires.

170

171 Director Jackson also noted that, although the Toxicology Section has slightly decreased case 172 turnaround times for the past several quarters, the delays are still impacting the Office of the 173 Chief Medical Examiner and DUI-D cases. DFS is currently working on new methods to 174 decrease turnaround times and newly hired examiners are in training.

175

176 Director Jackson also reminded the Board that the Trace Evidence Section lost three scientist 177 positions through budget reductions last year that were restored during the General Assembly 178 Session. The Department has two newly hired examiners in training. One position is still in the 179 recruitment process.

- 180
- 181 <u>Goals for 2016:</u>

Director Jackson reported to the Board that in 2016 the Fusion for DNA casework will be complete. The validation of the Powerplex Fusion Kit for case work has begun in the Central Laboratory and it is anticipated to be complete by the spring of 2016. After the validation is completed in the Central Laboratory, the regional laboratories will begin their validations. The Department anticipates being ready to report on 24 areas of DNA by the fall of 2016. The national deadline for laboratories to move to reporting 24 areas of DNA is early 2017.

188

Brad Jenkins, Forensic Biology Program Manager, explained TrueAllele to the Board. It is a computer system used by DFS to calculate statistics for complicated mixture profiles, will also under go additional validation to include the 24 areas of DNA contained in the new Powerplex

192 Fusion Kit. Currently, this system is in use with the Powerplex 16 kit, which tests 16 areas of 193 DNA.

193 194

195 Director Jackson reported to the Board that in 2016 DFS will complete the upgrade the current Laboratory Information Management System (LIMS) to a newer version. Training is complete 196 197 for sections champions, Program Managers, and System Administrators. Testing of the new 198 LIMS will begin this month and it is scheduled to "Go Live" by March 31, 2016. All DFS staff 199 will be trained on the new LIMS in February 2016. The project must be completed by July 2016 200 when the current server reaches the end of its life cycle. Once the new LIMS is "Live", Phase II 201 of the upgrade will begin. Phase II will add new features which includes pre-submission data 202 entry for evidence and electronic distribution of Certificates of Analysis.

203

204 Old Business

205

- 206 <u>Status of the Post-Conviction DNA Testing Program and Notification Project:</u>
- G. Stewart Petoe, Director of Legal Affairs of the Virginia State Crime Commission (VSCC, reported for Kristen Howard, Chair of the DNA Notification Subcommittee. Mr. Petoe reported that the VSCC has been working on three major points in regards to the project; review of the "inconclusive" case files, next of kin letters, and the database verification project.
- 211

Since the October 2015 meeting, all of the "inconclusive" case files had been reviewed and recommendations for testing have been made. The recommended "inconclusive" case files have been sent for testing. VSCC has completed receiving contact information for the next of kin for 13 deceased eliminated individuals. VSCC is on track to mail the next of kin letters in the next month.

217

VSCC is continuing the database verification project to confirm the testing and notification status of each listed suspect in each case and enter the information into a database. The review of "eliminated" files is complete. The "inconclusive" case file group will be next to be verified.

- 221
- 222 SB658 PERK Inventory Update/2016 Legislation:

223 Ms. Herndon updated the Board on the PERK Inventory and the PERK Work Group. The

Department submitted a revised PERK Inventory Report to the General Assembly, which was reprinted on and posted to the Legislative Information System website on December 16, 2016.

reprinted on and posted to the Legislative Information System website on December 16, 2016. Ms. Herndon reminded the Board that the July 1 PERK Inventory Report had identified 2.369

Ms. Herndon reminded the Board that the July 1 PERK Inventory Report had identified 2,369 untested kits in the custody of law enforcement. Eighteen agencies submitted updated inventories for the revised report, which identified a total of 2,902 untested kits in the custody of law enforcement.

229 law enfor

231 Ms. Herndon also reminded the Board that the PERK Work Group, which was convened by the 232 Governor in response to the July 1 Inventory Report, was tasked with evaluating criteria for PERK evidence testing in the Commonwealth. The Work Group was chaired by Secretary of 233 234 Public Safety and Homeland Security Brian Moran and included as members First Lady Dorothy 235 McAuliffe and representatives of victim advocate groups, Commonwealth's Attorneys, the 236 criminal defense bar, law enforcement, forensic nurses, and DFS. The Work Group met on three 237 occasions and also created four Subcommittees, which each met to develop recommendations for its specific subject area. The four Subcommittees were: Hospital/Collection Issues, Law 238 239 Enforcement/Submission Issues, Testing/Data Bank Issues and Victim Consent/Notification 240 Issues. The full Work Group adopted a number of recommendations related to the handling of 241 PERKs.

242 Ms. Herndon reviewed the recommendations adopted by the PERK Work Group that would be 243 included in legislation during the upcoming Session. The Work Group identified a number of its 244 recommendation for inclusion in what it termed its "PERK Act" legislation. These 245 recommendations require all anonymous PERKs to be submitted to DCLS for storage for a 246 minimum of two years. After a PERK is collected from a victim who is reporting the offense, 247 the hospital is to notify law enforcement of its collection, and law enforcement is to pick up the 248 kit "forthwith." Law enforcement must submit the kit to DFS for testing within 60 days of 249 receiving it. All PERKs are to be submitted to DFS for analysis except the following: 250 anonymous PERKs; PERKs collected by the OCME in a routine death investigation; PERKs 251 related to out of state offenses; and when it has been determined that the evidence in the PERK 252 was not connected to a criminal offense. If the determination that the PERK is not connected to 253 a criminal offense is made after the PERK has been submitted to DFS, and law enforcement or 254 the Commonwealth's Attorney provide this information in writing to DFS, DFS will be required 255 to expunge the DNA profile from the Data Bank. The recommendations to be included in the 256 proposed PERK Act also address the victim's right to be notified of scientific analysis 257 information, specify that profiles developed from the PERKs shall be uploaded to local, state or 258 national data banks only if eligible per DFS procedures and in accordance with state and federal 259 law, and clarify that failure to comply with the procedures is not grounds for a defendant to 260 challenge the admissibility of the evidence or set aside the conviction or sentence. Ms. Herndon noted that the Governor's Introduced Budget includes the funding for the fiscal impact DFS 261 262 projected would be associated with the PERK Act bill.

Ms. Herndon advised the Board that the PERK Work Group adopted a recommendation related to the Board that will be a DFS agency bill. It will add a victim advocate as a member of this Board and delete an outdated reference in the Code specifying that the Chairman of the Board of the Virginia Institute of Forensic Science and Medicine (VIFSM). VIFSM formally dissolved in 2010. By adding victim advocate, the bill restores the FSB to its originally specified 15 members. Delegate-Elect Jennifer Boysko will serve as the patron of this bill.

- 269
- 270 New Business
- 271

272 Board of Pharmacy Emergency Scheduled Compounds:

273 M. Scott Maye, Chemistry Program Manager, reported to the Board that pursuant to Code § 274 54.1-3443(D), the Board of Pharmacy amended its regulation through an expedited process to 275 temporarily place six new compounds into the emergency scheduled compounds. DFS had 276 identified the six compounds for recommended inclusion by the Board of Pharmacy into the 277 emergency schedule. All six were added to the Emergency Schedule August 12, 2015. An 278 additional six were identified by DFS and recommended to the Board of Pharmacy and were 279 added to the emergency schedule December 2, 2015. Legislation for the 2016 General Assembly 280 Session includes all twelve compounds added the Emergency Schedule since August 2015. Bills 281 including the twelve compounds have not been filed to date.

282

Mr. Maye presented the reporting language that will be included on certificates of analysis that include compounds added to Schedule 1 pursuant to the Board of Pharmacy Regulation. Mr. Maye also informed the Board that the Department would be recommending six new compounds to the Board of Pharmacy for emergency scheduling. The compounds are due to the Board of Pharmacy by January 15, 2016.

- 288
- 289 <u>Texas Hair Microscopy Case Review:</u>

290 Lynn Robitaille-Garcia, Texas Forensic Science Commission (TFSC), General Counsel, gave a 291 presentation by phone to the Board on the Texas Experience; Conducting a review of hair 292 microscopy cases as a matter of ethical duty. Amy Curtis, Department Counsel, assisted with the 293 presentation and introduced Ms. Robitaille-Garcia to the Board. Ms. Robitaille-Garcia began 294 with a background on the Texas Forensic Science Commission and the Texas Hair Microscopy 295 Hair review project. In 2013, the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) reported a concern about 296 the way the results of microscopic hair comparisons were described in court testimony. The FBI 297 conducted a review of its own hair microscopy cases. In 2014, Texas Association of Crime Lab 298 Directors (TACLD) made the decision to move forward with a review of all hair microscopy 299 cases in Texas. The TFSC was tasked with conducting the statewide review.

300

301 Ms. Robitaille-Garcia presented an outline of the process the TSFC created to move forward 302 with the case review project. Criteria were set for case files that needed to be pulled and 303 reviewed. A team was created to review the hair microscopy case files where there was a 304 conviction and an examiner testified on hair microscopy in the case. The team developed a 305 review process of the selected cases, and once a case was identified as needing further 306 investigation, the team analyzed the transcripts closely. Cases identified as having 307 overstatements made in Court were deemed eligible for notification. In the cases deemed 308 eligible for notification, the prosecutor's office and the last counsel of record for the suspect 309 were notified.

310

311 Ms. Robitaille-Garcia shared examples of the transcripts found in the cases reviewed. She also 312 shared examples of which cases were recommended for notifications and which were not 313 recommended for notification, and the reasoning used to make the determination.

314

315 Ms. Curtis then discussed with the Board the Department's possible need to do a similar hair 316 microscopy case review. The Chair appointed a hair microscopy case review subcommittee to 317 set up a process for reviewing case files and identifying hair microscopy cases to make a 318 recommendation to the Board. The subcommittee includes David Long, Lt. Col. Northern, and

- 319 Vince Donoghue. DFS staff will be available to the subcommittee for questions and 320 stakeholders may be brought in if needed. A date will be selected for the subcommittee in the 321 future.
- 322
- The Board discussed with Director Jackson how DFS currently handles legal training, cognitive bias, and the Department's position on testimony.
- 325
- Victoria Cochran, Deputy Secretary of Public Safety and Homeland Security, addressed theBoard and thanked the members for their service.
- 328

329 <u>Public Comment</u>

330 There was no public comment.

331332 <u>Next Meeting</u>

- The next meeting of the Forensic Science Board is set for May 11, 2016.
- 334

335 Adjournment

- 336 Mr. Hade moved that the meeting of the Board be adjourned, which was seconded by Lt. Col
 337 Northern and passed by unanimous vote.
- 338
- The meeting adjourned at 11:15 a.m.